

# Review of *Two Quasi 2-Groups*

There are several places where you can improve the techniques of proof. The argument for the existence of 15 elements whose order is a power of 2 in  $\mathbb{Z}_5 \rtimes_{\phi} \mathbb{Z}_4$  is not correct. Consider the element  $x^2y$ . You claim that the order of this element is a power of 2. Since  $xyx^{-1} = y^{-1}$ , we have that  $x^2y = yx^2$  and  $(x^2y)^4 = x^8y^4 = y^{-1} \neq e$ . Hence,  $|x^2y|$  does not divide 4. Therefore,  $x^2y$  is not a power of 2, since  $|\mathbb{Z}_5 \rtimes_{\phi} \mathbb{Z}_4| = 20$ . You do not need to count elements to verify your claim that  $P(G) = G$  (see below).

You will find specific comments about the paper below.

NOTE: A positive number is the line number from the top. A negative number is the line number counted from the bottom.

## Comments

Page	Line Number	Comment
1		
	-7	The number on the definition should be 2.1 (not 1.1). Usually a definition has one statement in it. This seems to be a cross between a definition and a lemma. In the paper you just focus on proving criterion 2. You have not used the other ‘definitions’ here.
2		
	4-5	Do you mean $\phi(x)(y) = y^{-1}$ where $x$ is a generator of $\mathbb{Z}_4$ ?
	-6	There are 5 Sylow 2-subgroups, each with 4 elements. Are you claiming that the intersection of any two Sylow 2-subgroups is trivial? How do you know this? This is not true. You can fix your argument (see below).
3		
	1-2	I think this may be the typesetting device you are using. The spacing makes it hard to read. For example: $x^2y^2$ instead of $x^2 y^2$ .
	4	“In particular ... power of 2” You are basing this off of page 2 line -6.

## Comments

Page	Line Number	Comment
	9	To show that $P(G) = G$ you can use the fact that the orders of $x$ and $xy$ are powers of 2. You do not need to use Sylow here.
4		
	2	$[(x_1, y_1), z_1]$ is much easier to read than $[(x_1, y_1), z_1]$ .
5		
	4	There are at least 10 elements in the subgroup generated by the elements of order 2. Now use a theorem of Lagrange.